Volume 2004 Number 1

Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal is published by the Brigham Young University Department of Educational Leadership and the J. Reuben Clark Law School, Provo, Utah 84602. All communications should be sent to the editorial offices at the J. Reuben Clark Law School.

Views expressed herein are to be attributed to their authors and not to the Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal nor to Brigham Young University, unless otherwise indicated.

Subscriptions: The Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal is published twice annually. The subscription rate is $32 for one year, $51 for two years. Periodicals postage paid at Provo, Utah, and at additional mailing office Pub. # 128170. Send address changes to Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal, J. Reuben Clark Law School, Room 471G, Provo, Utah 84602.

Citation: 2004 BYU EDUC. & L.J. [page number]

Board of Advisors

Charles Russo, J.D., Ed. D.
University of Dayton

Richard Fossey, J.D., Ed.D.
University of Houston

Fred Hartmeister, J.D., Ed.D.
Texas Tech University

Jay Heubert, J.D., Ed.D.
Teachers College, Columbia

Ralph Mawdsley, J.D., Ph.D.
Cleveland State University

Julie Mead, Ph. D.
University of Wisconsin, Madison

Martha McCarthy, Ph.D.
Indiana University, Bloomington

Preston C. Green, III, J.D., Ed.D.
University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Philip T. K. Daniel, J.D., Ed.D.
Ohio State University

Frank Brown, Ph.D.
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Doug Stewart, Ph.D.
Queensland University of Technology; Editor of Australia & New Zealand Journal of Law & Education

Julie Underwood, J.D., Ph.D.
Associate Executive Director & General Counsel, National School Boards Association
BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY
J. REUBEN CLARK LAW SCHOOL FACULTY

Dean of the Law School
H. Reese Hansen

Faculty

Augustine-Adams, Kif (1995), B.A., J.D.
Backman, James H. (1974), A.B., J.D.
Burns, Jean W. (1986), B.A., J.D.
Cameron, Scott W. (1989), B.A., M.A., J.D.
Dominguez, David (1989), B.A., J.D.
Driessen, Marguerite A. (1996), B.A., J.D.
Durham, W. Cole, Jr. (1976), A.B., J.D.
EchoHawk, Larry (1995), B.S., M.B.A., J.D.
Farmer, Larry C. (1977), B.S., Ph.D.
Fee, John E. (2000), B.A., J.D.
Fleming, J. Clifton, Jr. (1974), B.S., J.D.
Floyd, C. Douglas (1980), B.S., J.L.B.
Gedicks, Frederick M. (1990), B.A., J.D.
Gerdy, Kristin (1995), B.A., J.D.
Goldsmith, Michael (1985), B.S., J.D.
Gordon, James D. III (1984), B.A., J.D.
Hansen, H. Reese (1974), B.S., J.D.
Hoagland, Mary (1994), B.A., M.A., J.D.
Loveless, A. Scott (2001), B.A., J.D., Ph.D.
Lundberg, Constance K. (1982), B.A., J.D.
Neeleman, Stanley D. (1978), B.A., M.A., J.D.
Preston, Cheryl Bailey (1989), B.A., J.D.
Pullins, Kathy D. (1988), B.A., J.D.
Thomas, David A. (1974), B.A., J.D.
Wardle, Lynn D. (1978), B.A., J.D.
Welch, John W. (1980), B.A., M.A., J.D.
Wilkins, Richard G. (1984), B.A., J.D.
Williams, Gerald R. (1969), B.A., J.D.
Wood, Stephen G. (1976), B.A., J.D., J.S.D.
Worthen, Kevin J. (1987), B.A., J.D.
Part Time & Adjunct Faculty

Afleck, Adam S.  
Benson, Hon. Dee V.  
Bradshaw, Susan  
Brian, Pat B.  
Chasson, Susan P.  
Child, David  
Collins, Kent  
Craig, Alison E.  
Davis, Mark D.  
Duncan, William C.  
Enke, Alan A.  
Fackrell, Tamara  
Ferrin, Scott E.  
Griffith, Susan W.  
Hansen, Dale T.  
Israelsen, R. Burns  
Janis, Blair  
Jensen, Mary O.  
Jones, Sara D.  
Kono, David M.

Lindsay, Hon. Kay A.  
Lindquist, Kay A.  
Long, Lance N.  
Lorimer, Brent  
Loveless, Scott W.  
Mabey, Ralph R.  
Maxwell, Robert  
Melendez, Barbara  
Murray, Kevin R.  
Nuffer, David  
Owen, Stanford B.  
Peterson, Janet  
Rice, Vernon R.  
Richards, Jonathan W.  
Schofield, Jonathon R.  
Stringham, John C.  
Todd, David R.  
Visick, H. Hal  
Wilkins, Michael J.  
Wise, Jane H.

Law Library Faculty

Armond, David  
Averett, Steve E.  
Conklin, Curt E.  
Fletcher, Galen L.  

Hill, Gary  
Lyman, Lovisa  
Sears, Dennis S.  
Urquiaga, Laureen C.
BRIGHAM YOUNG UNIVERSITY
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP
AND FOUNDATIONS

Chair
E. Vance Randall

Professors
Holsinger, Donald (1972), Ph.D.
Patterson, Robert S. (1968), Ph.D. (Dean, College of Education)

Associate Professors
Baugh, Steven C. (1978) Ed.D.
Geo-JaJa, MacLeans (1986) Ph.D.
Hite, Steven J. (1985) Ed.D.
Mayes, Clifford T. (1997) Ph.D.
Randall, E. Vance (1989) Ph.D.
Richards, LeGrand (1982) Ph.D.
Webb, Clark D. (1970), Ph.D.
Williams, Ellen J. (1990) Ed.D.

Assistant Professors
Hite, Julie M. (1999) Ph.D.
Willardson, J. D. (1987) Ed.D.

Clinical Professor
Poulsen, Denis (1979) M.Ed.

Visiting Scholars
Hyer, Karen (1968) J.D., Ph.D.
INTRODUCTION

The Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal is published twice yearly through a cooperative effort of the J. Reuben Clark Law School and the Brigham Young University Department of Educational Leadership and Foundations. It provides a forum for scholarly works concerning legal topics within the field of education. The primary focus of the Journal is on discussions of legal issues faced in higher education and by K-12 school administrators, teachers, and their legal advisors.

As one of a limited number of arenas for scholarly discussion in the field of education law, the Journal is always in the process of considering papers to publish. Papers for the first issue of volume 2005 should be submitted by Monday, August 2, 2004. Papers for the second issue of volume 2005 should be submitted by Friday, November 26, 2004. Papers dealing in any area of education law are considered by the Journal staff for publication. An abstract, accompanied by a resume or vita for the author(s), should be included with submissions.

To expedite the editing and publication process, all papers should be submitted electronically, in Microsoft Word version 97 or newer, to the e-mail address below. Subsequent communications will be sent to authors by e-mail whenever possible. When e-mail is unavailable, please mail a hard copy and a computer diskette. The BYU Education and Law Journal reserves the right to reject paper submissions for any reason.

To submit papers, subscribe to the Journal, obtain past issues, or make comments, please contact the Journal at:

BYU Education and Law Journal
Brigham Young University
471G JRCB
Provo, UT 84602
(801) 422-3671
lawed@lawgate.byu.edu
Finding Success in the “Cauldron of Competition:” The Effectiveness of Academic Support Programs  
Leslie Yalof Garfield & Kelly Koenig Levi ............................................................... 1

Trying to Push a Square Peg through a Round Hole: Why the Higher Education Style of Strict Scrutiny Review Does Not Fit When Courts Consider K–12 Admissions Programs  
James Nial Robinson II ....................................................................................... 51

High School Exit Exams Meet IDEA—An Examination of the History, Legal Ramifications, and Implications for Local School Administrators and Teachers  
Jennifer R. Rowe ............................................................................................... 75

Affirmative Action: Challenges and Opportunities  
Jeramy R. Green ................................................................................................. 139

The Sport of Numbers: Manipulating Title IX to Rationalize Discrimination against Women  
Lisa Yonka Stevens ............................................................................................ 155