

1984

State of Utah v. Elroy Tillman : Brief of Appellant

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/uofu_sc2

Original Brief submitted to the Utah Supreme Court; funding for digitization provided by the Institute of Museum and Library Services through the Library Services and Technology Act, administered by the Utah State Library, and sponsored by the S.J. Quinney Law Library; machine-generated OCR, may contain errors. Martin Verhoef, James N. Barber, and David E Yocom; Attorneys for Appellant

Recommended Citation

Brief of Appellant, *Utah v. Tillman*, No. 19000 (1984).
https://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/uofu_sc2/4532

This Brief of Appellant is brought to you for free and open access by BYU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Utah Supreme Court Briefs (1965 –) by an authorized administrator of BYU Law Digital Commons. For more information, please contact hunterlawlibrary@byu.edu.

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF
THE STATE OF UTAH

STATE OF UTAH,)
)
 Plaintiff-Respondent,)
)
 vs.) Case No. 19000
)
 ELROY TILLMAN,)
)
 Defendant-Appellant.)

BRIEF OF APPELLANT

Appeal from the Third Judicial District in and for Salt Lake County, State of Utah, the Honorable Ernest F. Baldwin presiding.

MARTIN VERHOEF
JAMES N. BARBER
DAVID E. YOCOM
255 East 400 South, Suite 100
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
Telephone: (801) 355-8998
Attorneys for Appellant

DAVID WILKINSON
Attorney General
236 State Capitol
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114
Attorney for Respondent

FILED

JUN 7 1964

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF
THE STATE OF UTAH

STATE OF UTAH,)	
)	
Plaintiff-Respondent,)	
)	
vs.)	Case No. 19000
)	
ELROY TILLMAN,)	
)	
Defendant-Appellant.)	

BRIEF OF APPELLANT

Appeal from the Third Judicial District in and for Salt Lake County, State of Utah, the Honorable Ernest F. Baldwin presiding.

MARTIN VERHOEF
JAMES N. BARBER
DAVID E. YOCOM
255 East 400 South, Suite 100
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
Telephone: (801) 355-8998
Attorneys for Appellant

DAVID WILKINSON
Attorney General
236 State Capitol
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114
Attorney for Respondent

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
STATEMENT OF THE NATURE OF THE CASE	1
DISPOSITION IN LOWER COURT.	1
RELIEF SOUGHT ON APPEAL	1
STATEMENT OF FACTS.	2
ARGUMENT.	21
POINT I: COUNSEL'S COMMENTS CONCERNING DEFENDANT'S FAILURE TO TESTIFY REQUIRE REVERSAL.	21
POINT II: COMMENTS DURING SUMMATION WERE IMPROPER AND, IN SUM, REQUIRE REVERSAL.	30
POINT III: EXCLUSION OF POLYGRAPH OPINION EVIDENCE WAS A DENIAL OF "DUE PROCESS".	33
POINT IV: DEFENDANT WAS DENIED A MEANINGFUL COMPARISON OF A LIFE SENTENCE WITH THE DEATH PENALTY.	53
POINT V: THE SENTENCE OF DEATH IS DISPROPORTIONATE TO THE CRIME, THE IMMUNITY GRANTED THE ACCOMPLICE AND THE SENTENCES METED OUT IN SIMILAR CASES	56
POINT VI: APPELLANT'S CONVICTION IS INFIRM BECAUSE IT IS BASED ON A DUPLICITOUS INFORMATION	65
POINT VII: A CAPITAL CONVICTION CANNOT BE OBTAINED UNDER THE FELONY-MURDER RULE WHEN THE FELONY IS MERGED OR INCLUDED IN THE MURDER ITSELF.	69
POINT VIII: SECTION 76-3-207, U.C.A., IS CONSTITUTIONALLY DEFECTIVE BECAUSE IT FAILS TO LIMIT AGGRAVATING CIRCUMSTANCES AND PERMITS THE JURY TO RELY ON ANY FACTS IN AGGRAVATION	78
POINT IX: THE REASONABLE DOUBT INSTRUCTIONS GIVEN WERE CONSTITUTIONALLY INFIRM AND COULD NOT BE HARMLESS ERROR	82
POINT X: APPELLANT'S JURY PANEL UNDERREPRESENTED RACIAL AND ETHNIC MINORITIES	84
CONCLUSION.	88

TABLE OF AUTHORITIESCASES

	<u>Page</u>
Alford v. United States, 282 U.S. 687, 75 L.Ed. 624, 51 S.Ct. 218 (1931)	46
Anders v. California, 386 U.S. 738, 18 L.Ed.2d 4923, 87 S.Ct. 1396 (1967)	84
Anderson v. Nelson, 390 U.S. 523, 20 L.Ed.2d 81, 88 S.Ct. 1133 reh. den., 391 U. S. 929 (1968)	24
Andrews v. Morris, 607 P.2d 816 (Utah, 1980)	62
Bell v. Ohio, 438 U.S. 637, 57 L.Ed.2d 1010, 98 S.Ct. 2977 (1978)	51
Bell v. Watkins, 692 F.2d 1002 (5th Cir., 1982)	80
Bowder v. State, 639 P.2d 889 (Wyo., 1982)	31
Brady v. Maryland, 373 U.S. 83, 10 L.Ed.2d 215, 83 S.Ct. 1194 (1963)	47
Brooks v. Francis, 716 F.2d 280, (11th Cir., 1983)	29
Carter v. Jury Commission, 396 U.S.320, 24 L.Ed.2d 549, 90 S.Ct. 518 (1970)	85
Chapman v. California, 386 U.S. 18, 17 L.Ed.2d 705, 87 S.Ct. 824 (1967)	24,83
Commonwealth v. Vitello, 381 N.E.2d 582 (Mass., 1978) . .	40,41, 42
Davis v. United States, 160 U.S. 469, 40 S.Ct. 499 (1895)	83,84
Doyle v. Ohio, 426 U.S. 610, 49 L.Ed.2d 91, 96 S.Ct. 2240 (1976)	28
Dunn v. Perrin, 570 F.2d 21 (1st Cir., 1978).	82,83 84
Duren v. Missouri, 439 U.S. 35, 58 L.Ed.2d 579, 99 S.Ct. 664 (1979)	85,87

Eddings vs. Oklahoma, 455 U.S. 104, 71 L.Ed.2d 1, 102 S.Ct. 869 (1982)	48,52
Frye v. United States, 293 F. 1013 (D.C. App., 1923) . .	40
Furhman v. Georgia, 408 U.S. 238, 33 L.Ed.2d 346, 92 S.Ct. 2726 (1972)	60,61 80
Gardner v. Florida, 430 U.S. 349, 51 L.Ed.2d 393, 97 S.Ct. 1197 (1977)	29
Godfrey v. Georgia, 446 U.S. 420, 64 L.Ed.2d 398, 100 S.Ct. 1759 (1980)	57
Green v. Georgia, 442 U.S. 95, 60 L.Ed.2d 738, 99 S.Ct. 2150 (1979)	48,50
Gregg v. Georgia, 428 U.S. 153, 49 L.Ed.2d 859, 96 S.Ct. 2909 (1976)	81
Griffin v. California, 380 U.S. 609, 14 L.Ed.2d 106, 85 S.Ct. 1229 (1965)	23
Henry v. Wainwright, 661 F.2d 56 (5th Cir., 1981) cert. granted 457 U.S. 1114 (1983)	80
Hernandez v. Texas, 347 U.S. 475, 98 L.Ed.2d 866, 74 S.Ct. 667 (1954)	87
In re Winship, 497 U.S. 358, 25 L.Ed.2d 368, 90 S.Ct. 1068 (1978)	83,84
Jordan v. Watkins, 681 F.2d 1067 (5th Cir., 1982) reh. den., 688 F.2d 395 (1982)	80
Lockett v. Ohio, 438 U.S. 586, 57 L.Ed.2d 973, 98 S.Ct. 2954 (1978)	51,52
McMorris v. Israel, 743 F.2d 458 (7th Cir., 1981)	46
Meeks v. State, 339 So.2d 186 (Fla., 1976) cert. den. 439 U.S. 991 (1978)	60
Murphy v. Texas, cert. granted 35 Cr.L.Rptr. 4067	78
People v. Dillon, 34 Cal.3d 441, 668 P.2d 697 (1983) . .	60
People v. Green, 164 Cal.Rptr. 1, 609 P.2d 468 (1980) . .	73,75 76

People v. Ireland, 70 Ca.2d 527, 75 Cal.Rptr. 188, 450 P.2d 580 (1969)	72
People v. Moran, 246 N.Y. 100, 158 N.E. 35 (1927)	70,71
People v. Thompson, 165 Cal.Rptr. 289, 611 P.2d 883 (1983)	75,76 77
People v. Wilson, 1 Cal.3d 431, 82 Cal.Rptr. 494, 462 P.2d 22 (1969)	72,77
Pierre v. Morris, 607 P.2d 812 (Utah, 1980)	62
Pointer v. Texas, 380 U.S. 400, 13 L.Ed.2d 923, 85 S.Ct. 1065 (1963)	46
Pope v. State, ___ So.2d ___, 34 Cr.L.Rptr. 2166 (Fla., 1983)	26
Pulley v. Harris, ___ U.S. ___, 79 L.Ed.2d 29, 104 S.Ct. ___, 34 Cr.L.Rptr. 3027 (1984).	57,62
Smith v. Illinois, 300 U.S. 129, 19 L.Ed.2d 956, 88 S.Ct. 748 (1968)	46
Spinkellink v. Wainwright, 578 F.2d 582 (5th Cir., 1978) cert. den. 440 U.S. 976 (1979)	62
State v. Abel, 600 P.2d 994 (Utah, 1979)	36
State v. Andrews, 574 P.2d 709 (Utah, 1977)	58,65
State v. Bishop, Case No. CR-83-1314, et al., Third Judicial District, Salt Lake County, Utah.	85,87
State v. Branch, 415 P.2d 766 (Ore., 1966)	71
State v. Brown, 607 P.2d 261 (Utah, 1980)	29,50
State v. Clayton, 639 P.2d 168 (Utah, 1981)	84
State v. Codianna., 573 P.2d 343 (Utah, 1977)	57
State v. Collins, 612 P.2d 775 (Utah, 1980)	36,37 38,39
State v. Creviston, 646 P.2d 750 (Utah, 1982)	31
State v. Dubois, 98 P.2d 354 (Utah, 1940)	65

State v. Eaton., 569 P.2d 1114 (Utah, 1977)	26
State v. Essman, 403 P.2d 540 (Ariz., 1965)	71
State v. Green, 616 P.2d 628 (Wash., 1980)	65,68
State v. Hales, 652 P.2d 1290 (Utah, 1982)	29
State v. Jenkins, 523 P.2d 1232 (Utah, 1974)	36,41 43
State v. Johnson, 663 P.2d 48 (Utah, 1983)	31,32
State v. Peterson, 240 P.2d 504 (Utah, 1952)	65
State v. Pierre, 572 P.2d 1338 (Utah, 1977)	57,58, 62,81
State v. Pierren, 583 P.2d 69 (Utah, 1978)	87
State v. Plath, 284 S.E.2d 221 (S.C., 1981)	32
State v. Rebeterano, _____ P.2d _____, Case No. 18428, filed 4/30/84 (Utah, 1984)	41
State v. Sisneros, 631 P.2d 856 (Utah, 1981)	77
State v. St. Clair, 3 U.2d 230, 282 P.2d 323 (1955) . . .	56
State v. Sloan, 298 S.E.2d 92 (S.C., 1982)	25
State v. Stenback, 78 Utah 350, 2 P.2d 1050 (1931) . . .	56
State v. Tanner, 675 P.2d 539 (Utah, 1983)	36,41, 44
State v. Valdez, 513 P.2d 422 (Utah, 1973)	31
State v. Wiswell, 639 P.2d 146 (Utah, 1981)	28
State v. Wood, 648 P.2d 71 (Utah, 1982)	53,56, 57,63, 68
Stromberg v. California, 283 U.S. 359, 75 L.Ed. 1117, 51 S.Ct. 532, 73 A.L.R. 484 (1931)	67
Taylor v. Louisiana, 419 U.S. 522, 42 L.Ed.2d 690, 95 S.Ct. 692 (1975)	85

United States v. Gibson, 536 F.2d 1110 (5th Cir., 1976)	29
United States vs. Hart, 344 F.Supp. 522 (E.D. N.Y., 1971)	47
United States v. Ridling, 350 F.Supp. 90 (E.D. Mich., 1972)	40,43 44
United States v. Rochan, 563 F.2d 1246 (5th Cir., 1977)	24
United States v. Starks, 515 F.2d 112 (3rd Cir., 1975)	66
Willis v. Zant, 720 F.2d 1212 (11th Cir., 1983)	87
Yates v. United States., 354 U.S. 298, 1 L.Ed.2d 1356, 77 S.Ct. 1064 (1957)	67
Zant v. Stephens, _____ U.S. _____, 77 L.Ed.2d 235, 103 S.Ct. _____ (1983)	67

OTHER CITATIONS

	<u>Page</u>
Federal Rules of Evidence, Rule 608	43
Oklahoma Statutes, Title 21, Section 701.10 (1980)	52
United States Code, Title 18, Section 1951.	66
United States Constitution, Fifth Amendment	22
United States Constitution, Sixth Amendment	46
United States Constitution, Eighth Amendment.	52,57
United States Constitution, Fourteenth Amendment.	22,52
Utah Constitution, Article I, Section 12	22,46
Utah Rules of Evidence:	
Rule 7	42
Rule 46	34
Rule 47	34
Rule 48	35
Rule 56	35,40
Rule 58	36

Section 76-1-104, Utah Code Annotated	57,63
Section 76-3-203, Utah Code Annotated	54
Section 76-3-206, Utah Code Annotated	58
Section 76-3-207, Utah Code Annotated	49,52, 53,63, 79,81
Section 76-3-208, Utah Code Annotated	53
Section 76-5-202, Utah Code Annotated	1,69, 70,71 77,78, 80
Section 77-17-7, Utah Code Annotated	48,60
Section 77-27-3, Utah Code Annotated	55
Section 78-46-16, Utah Code Annotated	84
Bailey and Rothblatt, <u>Investigation and Preparation of Criminal Cases</u> , (19)	48
DeVitt and Blackmar, <u>Federal Jury Practice and Instructions</u> , Section 15.22 (3rd Ed., 1977).	41
<u>McCormick on Evidence</u> , 2d Ed. (1972).	43